Victoria Business School’s Assurance of Learning Process

Vicky Mabin
Associate Dean (Teaching and Learning)
Victoria Business School

Victoria University of Wellington
September 2012

Session plan

1. Overview of VBS’s ‘Assurance of Learning’ process
2. Examples of actual Assurance of Learning exercises
3. Discussion
Our faculty’s context

• **VUW Strategic Plan**
  – Learning and Teaching – move to ‘Active learning’
    • Pathways, Graduate Attributes
  – Resource utilisation
    • Reducing staff and student workloads in 15pts world

• **T&L**
  – Degree reforms here and elsewhere
  – New funding regime – student learning indicators
  – *Most academic staff not trained as teachers!* (Banta, IUPIU, ATE and HELT Conference, Wellington, Nov 2008)

• **Business School context**
  – International standing - benchmarking via accreditations
  – Specific need for **Assurance of Learning**

---

### 4 Key Questions in Assurance of Learning

1. What do we want our graduates to know?
2. Where/how will we provide opportunities for them to learn these things?
3. How will we know if the students have learnt them?
4. What will we (the faculty) change if the students haven’t learnt these things?
Assurance of Learning:
A Continuous Improvement Process

Mission, Vision & Values → Programme Learning Goals & Learning Objectives → Curriculum Mapping and Course LO’s → Assessment of learning → Check results and design improvements → Course delivery

“Closing the Loop!”

VBS’s Mission
The Victoria Business School creates and shares knowledge of governance and management of resources in the public and private sectors to develop capability and provide our stakeholders with a global perspective.

And our Vision:
Excellence at the nexus of research, teaching, and practice.
1. What do we want our graduates to know?

- Mission, Vision & Values
- Programme Learning Goals & Learning Objectives
- Curriculum Mapping and Course LO’s
- Check results and design improvements
- Course delivery
- Assessment of learning

Graduate Attributes

- VUW wide
  - Critical and Creative Thinking skills
  - Communication skills
  - Leadership skills
- VBS
  - Global/multicultural perspective
  - ‘Major Attributes’ for each Major (Content, skills, and disciplinary thinking)
BCom Learning Goals

Learning Goal 1: Critical and Creative Thinking
Our graduates will demonstrate application of critical and creative thinking skills to practical and theoretical problems

Learning Goal 2: Communication
Our graduates will be effective communicators

Learning Goal 3: Global and Multicultural Perspective
Our graduates will have a global and multicultural perspective

Learning Goal 4: Leadership
Our graduates will recognise, support and display leadership

Learning Goal 5: ‘Major Attributes’
Our graduates will develop specific knowledge and skills in at least one business, economics or public policy discipline area
Learning Objectives for LG1

Learning Goal 1: Critical and Creative Thinking
*Our graduates will demonstrate application of critical and creative thinking skills to practical and theoretical problems*

**Learning Objectives.** They will be able to:

a. analyse a complex situation which could be viewed from multiple perspectives;

b. use/apply analytical techniques, models and/or frameworks appropriately in specific contexts;

c. reflect critically on practical and theoretical issues;

d. display creative thinking when faced with practical and/or theoretical problems.

Learning Objectives for LG2

Learning Goal 2: Communication
*Our graduates will be effective communicators*

**Learning objectives.** They will bring creative skills to the research, analysis, planning, and writing stages of academic essays and other documents, and will be able to present it clearly and effectively to an audience. That will involve being able to:

a. research, plan, and produce written assignments meeting academic standards;

b. apply advanced written communication skills in a private or public sector ‘business’ context;

c. deliver a professional quality presentation accompanied by appropriate technology;

d. demonstrate oral communication skills by their participation in small group learning environments such as tutorials and workshops.
2. Where/how will we provide opportunities for them to learn these things?

Curriculum Design

Revised BCom Structure
- 7 paper Core
- 15 point papers (mostly)
- Majors
- Minors
- Compulsory/capstone papers
Curriculum Mapping

Document A lists Major Attributes for each Major
Document B lists Course Learning Objectives for all courses, by Major
Curriculum map for each programme
Maps contributions of each Course to Learning Goals/Objectives, based on
  • Coverage in syllabus (High, Med, Low)
  • Whether Learning Goal/Objective is assessed for students’ grades

Section of BCom Curriculum Map

H=High, M=Med, L=Low coverage in syllabus
G= already being assessed for student grade
Assurance of Learning Process

Mission, Vision & Values

Programme Learning Goals & Learning Objectives

Curriculum Design and Mapping of Course LO's

Check results and design improvements

Assessment of student learning

Course delivery
Course Delivery

- Course offerings
- Course outlines
- Course learning objectives
- Assessments

Various checks along the way
- Quality Assurance processes agreed on by FCom Board in October 2011.

Workshops: on writing effective assignments to help ensure assessments are aligned with the programme Learning Goals and Course Learning Objectives

3. How will we know if the students have learnt them?

Mission, Vision & Values → Programme Learning Goals & Learning Objectives → Curriculum Design and Mapping of Course LO’s → Course delivery → Assessment of student learning → Check results and design improvements
Assess Achievement of Learning Goals/Objectives

– Need to assess LG’s/LO’s directly
  Grades vs Assessment of achievement of LO’s
  Direct vs Indirect measures
  Assessment Plan shows where we intend to assess
– Sample of student work
– Assessed using a rubric

Marketing’s AoL Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course Codes</th>
<th>LG1 Critical &amp; Creative Thinking</th>
<th>LG2 Communication</th>
<th>LG3 Global and Multicultural Perspectives</th>
<th>LG4 Leadership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MARK 101</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARK 202</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARK 203</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARK 211</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARK 301</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARK 302</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARK 311</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

LO1a Analyse a complex situation which could be viewed from multiple perspectives
LO1b Use/apply analytical techniques/models/frameworks appropriately in specific contexts
LO1c Reflect critically on practical and theoretical issues
LO2a Academic Writing
LO2b Business Writing
LO2c Presentation
LO2d Oral skills
LO3a Global environments
LO3b Adapt strategy
LO3c Legis/Govt policy impacts
LO3d Cross-Cultural
LO3e Multi-cultural
LO4a Lead discussion
LO4b Ethical
LO4c Group work

Skill development
A = Assessment for AoL
G = Assessment for Grading

H M L
Assurance of Learning v Grades

Assurance of Learning for each Learning Goal

% Unsatisfactory
% Satisfactory
% Exemplary

Oral Presentation Skills Rubric

Deliver a professional quality presentation using appropriate technology

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aspect</th>
<th>Exemplary</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Unsatisfactory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Audience Engagement</td>
<td>Audience fully engaged; Convincing responses to questions; Invokes useful discussion.</td>
<td>Audience mostly engaged; Adequate response to questions; Invokes some discussion.</td>
<td>Audience not engaged; Inability to answer questions; Inability to invoke discussion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisation</td>
<td>Tightly focussed; Well structured, theme is clear; Message very clear; Good timing.</td>
<td>Mostly focussed; Decipherable theme; Message is mostly clear; Keeps almost to time.</td>
<td>Rambling, unfocussed; Disorganised, unrelated; Message is unclear; Runs over time or too brief.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delivery</td>
<td>Smooth effective delivery; Good voice control; Appropriate eye contact; Appears relaxed; Speaks without notes.</td>
<td>Appropriate language; Okay voice control; Mostly appropriate eye contact; Appears mostly relaxed; Uses notes occasionally.</td>
<td>Incorrect or inappropriate language; Filler words, verbiage; Problems with voice control; Inappropriate eye contact; Appears tense, nervous; Reads and/or relies heavily on notes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visual Aids (Quality and Use)</td>
<td>Excellent visual aids; Seamless use of visual aids.</td>
<td>Appropriate visual aids; Appropriate use of visual aids.</td>
<td>Poor quality visual aids; Inexpert use of visual aids.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. What will we (the faculty) change if the students haven’t learnt these things?

- Mission, Vision & Values
- Programme Learning Goals & Learning Objectives
- Curriculum Design and Mapping of Course LO’s
- Assessment of student learning
- Check results and design improvements
- Course delivery

Analysing results of AoL exercises

- Assessment Exercise Report for each exercise
- Circulated to School for comment
- Essential statistics extracted for Summary Report on Assessment Exercises
- Summary Report circulated for review
- Discussion of findings and decisions on actions
Lessons from Assessment Exercises so far

- Holes in student learning
  - And what to do about them
    - ‘Closing the loop’
- Benefits of rubrics
  - For students
  - For staff
- Writing skills

Reviewing Assessment Results

- Written communications skills
  - FCom Action plan
- Critical/Creative thinking
  - Trial exercises; revised LO’s; rubrics
- Trial exercises covering other Learning Goals
- Phased over 5 -10 year horizon
Streamlining AoL Processes

• Strive to achieve more with less effort
• Dovetail with normal coursework marking with cross-checks from external assessors
• Assess multiple objectives separately but at same time
• Design assessment for AoL purposes as well as for grading
• Documenting and streamlining processes

Workshops and Collaboration

• Committees and reps for T&L throughout Faculty
• Working groups for rubrics
• Workshops run by our University’s teaching development and student learning support teams
• Collaboration with these teams and with the Library, students’ association etc
People working on AoL/T&L

• Teaching and Learning committee
  – One rep from each school plus Programme Directors, AD T&L and AD Students + student rep
  – Schools have own T&L Committee
• BCom Management Committee
  – One rep each school, ADS, ADTL, student rep
• Working groups
• Staff in schools
  – Attending workshops and forums
  – Discussing curricula
  – Doing assessments
  – Figuring out how to address problems identified
  – Reflecting on their teaching … and student learning?

Assessment for AoL
(To assess achievement of a LO)

- Identify Learning Objective to be assessed
- Identify appropriate rubric.
  - If none, then identify aspects (traits) necessary for achievement of Learning Objective
  - Construct scale or rubric giving clear definition to each point
  - Agree the rubric with all markers
- Agree on sample of student work
- Assess learning, using the rubric
- Copy sample of student work
- Forward to AoL administrator
### Assessment Exercises: Procedures and Reporting

#### Step 1. Planning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Agree selection of Learning Outcomes to be assessed (LO’s), and if YLF is jointly marked, LO’s.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Agree on selection of marking rubrics and related LO’s.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Agree on selection of marking rubrics and LO’s.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>Identify selection of marking rubrics and LO’s.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>Identify selection of marking rubrics and LO’s.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>Agree on selection of marking rubrics and related LO’s.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>Unmark assignment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>Return unmarked assignment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>Provide feedback, and comments (FCA / Coordinator).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Step 2. Data Collection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Assess as per the Assessment Exercises: Procedures and Reporting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Collect data.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Confirm the assessment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>Extract and tabulate the Assessment Exercises: Procedures and Reporting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Submit the assessment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>Assess the assessment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>Submit the assessment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>Extract and tabulate the Assessment Exercises: Procedures and Reporting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>Submit the assessment.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Step 3. Results, Findings, Actions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Ensure LO’s are complete.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Ensure LO’s are complete.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Ensure LO’s are complete.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Ensure LO’s are complete.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Ensure LO’s are complete.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Ensure LO’s are complete.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>Ensure LO’s are complete.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>Ensure LO’s are complete.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>Ensure LO’s are complete.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>Ensure LO’s are complete.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

### VBS - Assurance of Learning Check List

#### School A (Organizer's Checklist)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Identify course learning outcomes objectives ensuring each outcome is at least one hour of learning time and covers topics across 100 200 levels within each topic. Ensure course coordinators are notified that their course is assessed by 1 month before the start of the course.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>If a course / Coordinator is at Risk (when), identify and appropriate item of student work to be assessed to be reviewed for each LO and decide on rubrics to be used, contact BCA for advice needed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Identify / Coordinators / Lecturers, the time and methods marking framework rubrics.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Ensure on completion for the data collection - the final guidelines.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Ensure on completion for the data collection - the final guidelines.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Ensure on completion for the data collection - the final guidelines.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Ensure on completion for the data collection - the final guidelines.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Ensure on completion for the data collection - the final guidelines.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Ensure on completion for the data collection - the final guidelines.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### School B (Assessor's Checklist)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Mark up the mark, according to the marking criteria, and ensure all marks are clearly visible and understood.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Mark up the mark, according to the marking criteria, and ensure all marks are clearly visible and understood.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Mark up the mark, according to the marking criteria, and ensure all marks are clearly visible and understood.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Mark up the mark, according to the marking criteria, and ensure all marks are clearly visible and understood.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Mark up the mark, according to the marking criteria, and ensure all marks are clearly visible and understood.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

### Course Administrator's Checklist

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ensure marking is complete, accurate, and all marks are clearly visible and understood.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ensure marking is complete, accurate, and all marks are clearly visible and understood.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Ensure marking is complete, accurate, and all marks are clearly visible and understood.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Ensure marking is complete, accurate, and all marks are clearly visible and understood.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

### Attached Course-related rubrics and marks, as per VBS sample size guidelines. See Table An_Issuer_unit_Name, Assessment Procedure. Based for the CoA.”
Rubrics

- Well-defined scales/points on Primary Traits
- Inclusion of Holistic Score
- FCom standard rubrics
  - Differences from NCEA
- Use of rubrics for data collection for AoL
- Use of rubrics for feedback to students

Pointers for Rubrics

Defining Expectations
The most difficult aspect of constructing a rubric is formulating and clearly articulating criteria for different levels of achievement. Try to determine qualitative or quantitative differences that characterise achievement at the different levels.

Avoid
- different grades of the same character (good, better, best, etc)
- undefined terms (e.g. trivial work, good use of, significant work)
- value-laden terms (e.g. excellent or poor work – these terms may have meaning for the assessor but do not tell the student the standard expected nor what they can do to improve.

(Stephen Marshall, UTDC)
Easy mistakes … and what to do instead

• Group work
  – Use to assess Teamwork (BCom LO4c) but not other LO’s
• Rubric not tuned (too many E’s)
  – Try out on pilot, check across markers
• Assessment not suitable for LO
  – Set up so students likely to demonstrate well
• Too many borderline cases
  – Remember it’s not grading!
  – For AoL, we’re really only interested in broad categories
• Forgot to take copies of student work before handing back to students …
  – Have systems in place to catch it in time!

Questions, comments, further discussion and feedback

Thank you!