It’s assessment, Jim, but not as we know it!

**Vicky Mabin**
Associate Dean (Teaching and Learning), FCA

**Stephen Marshall**
Acting Director, UTDC

Victoria University of Wellington

Symposium on Assessment and Learner Outcomes
Victoria University of Wellington, September 2011
Talk outline

1. Overview of FCA’s ‘Assurance of Learning’ process
2. Results so far
3. What’s different from other models
4. Current challenges
4 Key Questions in Assurance of Learning

1. What do we want our graduates to know, do, and be?
2. Where/how will we provide opportunities for them to learn these things?
3. How will we know if the students have acquired them?
4. What will we (the faculty) change if the students haven’t learnt these things?
Assurance of Learning: A Continuous Improvement Process

Mission, Vision & Values

“Closing the Loop!”

Programme Learning Goals & Learning Objectives

Curriculum Mapping and Course LO’s

Check results and design improvements

Assessment of learning

Course delivery
Our Faculty’s Mission

The Faculty of Commerce and Administration pursues and shares knowledge of business, economics and management, to develop capability and provide our stakeholders with a global perspective.

And our Vision:
To be the scholarly hub driving New Zealand’s capital development.
1. What do we want our graduates to know?

- Mission, Vision & Values
- Programme Learning Goals & Learning Objectives
- Curriculum Mapping and Course LO’s
- Check results and design improvements
- Assessment of learning
- Course delivery
Graduate Attributes

**Graduate Attributes:** Skills, attributes and competencies
(Barrie, 2004; Oliver, 2011)

- VUW Generic Graduate Attributes (2005)
  - Critical and Creative Thinking skills
  - Communication skills
  - Leadership skills

- Additional FCA GA’s
  - Global/multicultural perspective
  - ‘Major Attributes’ for each Major (Content, skills, and disciplinary thinking)
BCA Learning Goals

Learning Goal 1: Critical and Creative Thinking
Our graduates will demonstrate application of critical and creative thinking skills to practical and theoretical problems

Learning Goal 2: Communication
Our graduates will be effective communicators

Learning Goal 3: Global and Multicultural Perspective
Our graduates will have a global and multicultural perspective

Learning Goal 4: Leadership
Our graduates will recognise, support and display leadership

Learning Goal 5: ‘Major Attributes’
Our graduates will develop specific knowledge and skills in at least one business, economics or public policy discipline area
Learning Objectives for LG1

Learning Goal 1: Critical and Creative Thinking

Our graduates will demonstrate application of critical and creative thinking skills to practical and theoretical problems

Learning Objectives. They will be able to:

a. analyse a complex situation which could be viewed from multiple perspectives;

b. use/apply analytical techniques, models and/or frameworks appropriately in specific contexts;

c. reflect critically on practical and theoretical issues;

d. display creative thinking when faced with practical and/or theoretical problems.
2. Where/how will we provide opportunities for them to learn these things?

- Mission, Vision & Values
- Programme Learning Goals & Learning Objectives
- Curriculum Design, and Mapping Course LO’s onto Programmes Learning Goals
- Check results and design improvements
- Assessment of learning
- Course delivery
### Section of BCA Curriculum Map

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course Codes</th>
<th>Learning Objectives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACCY 111</td>
<td>LO1a Analyse a complex situation which could be viewed from multiple perspectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECON 130</td>
<td>LO1b Use/apply analytical techniques/models frameworks appropriately in specific contexts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QUAN 102</td>
<td>LO1c Reflect critically on practical and theoretical issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARK 101</td>
<td>LO2a Academic Writing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INFO 101</td>
<td>LO2b Business Writing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MGMT 101</td>
<td>LO2c Presentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MGMT Major</td>
<td>LO2d Oral skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRIR 201</td>
<td>LO2e Global environments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MGMT 202</td>
<td>LO2f Adapt strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MGMT 205</td>
<td>LO2g Legis/Govt policy impacts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MGMT 206</td>
<td>LO2h Cross-Cultural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MGMT Major</td>
<td>LO3a Global environments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRR 201</td>
<td>LO3b Adapt strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MGMT Major</td>
<td>LO3c Legis/Govt policy impacts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRR 202</td>
<td>LO3d Cross-Cultural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MGMT Major</td>
<td>LO3e Multi-cultural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRR Major</td>
<td>LO3f Lead discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRR Major</td>
<td>LO4a Lead discussion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **H**=High, **M**=Med, **L**=Low coverage in syllabus
- **G**= already being assessed for student grade

---

**BCA Programme**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pathways</th>
<th>GA1</th>
<th>GA2</th>
<th>GA3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BCA Learning Goals</td>
<td>LG1 Critical &amp; Creative Thinking</td>
<td>LG2 Communication</td>
<td>LG3 Global and Multicultural Perspectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCA Core</td>
<td>LG4 Leadership</td>
<td>LG5 MGMT MA's</td>
<td>LG 5 HRIR MA's</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCA Core</td>
<td>LG5 MGMT MA's</td>
<td>LG 5 HRIR MA's</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**BCA Learning Objectives**

- **GA1**: LG1 Critical & Creative Thinking
- **GA2**: LG2 Communication
- **GA3**: LG3 Global and Multicultural Perspectives
- **GA 5 Major specific att**: LG5 MGMT MA's
- **GA 5 Major specific att**: LG 5 HRIR MA's

---

**Assessment for Grading**

- **G**= Assessment for Grading
3. How will we know if the students have learnt them?

Mission, Vision & Values → Programme Learning Goals & Learning Objectives → Curriculum Design and Mapping of Course LO's → Course delivery → Check results and design improvements → Assessment of student learning
Assess Achievement of Learning Goals/Objectives

Need to assess LG’s/LO’s
  Direct measurement preferred (cf. Indirect measures)
  Can’t rely on grades
  – Assessment Plan shows where we intend to assess
  – Sample of student work
  – Assessed using a rubric
# Marketing’s AoL Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BCA Programme</th>
<th>H M L Skill development</th>
<th>G = Assessment for Grading</th>
<th>A = Assessment for AoL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GA1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GA2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GA3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GA4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LG1 Critical &amp; Creative Thinking</td>
<td>LG2 Communication</td>
<td>LG3 Global and Multicultural Perspectives</td>
<td>LG4 Leadership</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course Codes</th>
<th>MARK101</th>
<th>MARK202</th>
<th>MARK203</th>
<th>MARK211</th>
<th>MARK301</th>
<th>MARK302</th>
<th>MARK311</th>
<th>MARK211</th>
<th>MARK202</th>
<th>MARK301</th>
<th>MARK311</th>
<th>MARK203</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>H</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>L</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>H</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>L</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>H</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>L</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>H</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>G</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>L</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>H</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**LO1a** Analyse a complex situation which could be viewed from multiple perspectives
**LO1b** Use/apply analytical techniques/models/frameworks appropriately in specific contexts
**LO1c** Reflect critically on practical and theoretical issues
**LO1d** Creative thinking
**LO2a** Academic Writing
**LO2b** Business Writing
**LO2c** Presentation
**LO2d** Oral skills
**LO3a** Global environments
**LO3b** Adapt strategy
**LO3c** Legis/Govt policy impacts
**LO3d** Cross-Cultural
**LO3e** Multi-cultural
**LO4a** Lead discussion
**LO4b** Ethical
**LO4c** Group work
**Assurance of Learning v Grades**

**Assurance of Learning** for each Learning Objective

- % Unsatisfactory
- % Satisfactory
- % Exemplary

**Grade for each student**

### BUSN 241 Assignment 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content ...</th>
<th>Quality of argument 40%</th>
<th>Report Presentation 20%</th>
<th>Total marks 100%</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Major Attributes</td>
<td>Critical Thinking Skills</td>
<td>Written Communications Skills</td>
<td>Structure</td>
<td>Clarity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Student 1
- Student 2
- Student 3
- Student 4
- Student 5
- Student 6
- Student 7
- Student 8
- Student 9
- Student 10
- Student 11
- Student 12
- Student 13
- Student 14
- Student 15
- Student 16
- Student 17
- Student 18
- Student 19
- Student 20
Oral Presentation Skills Rubric

Deliver a professional quality presentation using appropriate technology

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aspect</th>
<th>Exemplary</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Unsatisfactory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Audience Engagement</td>
<td>Audience fully engaged; Convincing responses to questions; Invokes useful discussion.</td>
<td>Audience mostly engaged; Adequate response to questions; Invokes some discussion.</td>
<td>Audience not engaged; Inability to answer questions; Inability to invoke discussion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisation</td>
<td>Tightly focussed; Well structured, theme is clear; Message very clear; Good timing.</td>
<td>Mostly focussed; Discriminable theme; Message is mostly clear; Keeps almost to time.</td>
<td>Rambling, unfocussed; Disorganised, unrelated; Message is unclear; Runs over time or too brief.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delivery</td>
<td>Smooth effective delivery; Good voice control; Appropriate eye contact; Appears relaxed; Speaks without notes.</td>
<td>Appropriate language; Okay voice control; Mostly appropriate eye contact; Appears mostly relaxed; Uses notes occasionally.</td>
<td>Incorrect or inappropriate language; filler words, verbose; Problems with voice control; Inappropriate eye contact; Appears tense, nervous; Reads and/or relies heavily on notes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visual Aids (Quality and Use)</td>
<td>Excellent visual aids; Seamless use of visual aids.</td>
<td>Appropriate visual aids; Appropriate use of visual aids.</td>
<td>Poor quality visual aids; Inept use of visual aids.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. What will we (the faculty) change if the students haven’t learnt these things?
### LO1b Use/apply analytical techniques/models/frameworks appropriately in specific contexts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assignment 1</th>
<th>Trait</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>S</th>
<th>U</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FCA rubric</td>
<td>Select Evidence</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sample size</td>
<td>Interpret Evidence</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>223 students</td>
<td>Use Analytical Technique</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class size</td>
<td>Generate Results</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assignment 2</th>
<th>Trait</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>S</th>
<th>U</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FCA rubric</td>
<td>Select Evidence</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sample size</td>
<td>Interpret Evidence</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>101 students</td>
<td>Use Analytical Technique</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>87%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class size</td>
<td>Generate Results</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>87%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### LO1c: Reflect critically on practical and theoretical issues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assignment 1</th>
<th>Trait</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>S</th>
<th>U</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FCA rubric</td>
<td>Question assumptions</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sample size</td>
<td>Draw valid conclusion</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48 students</td>
<td>Reflect</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assignment 2</th>
<th>Trait</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>S</th>
<th>U</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FCA rubric</td>
<td>Question assumptions</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sample size</td>
<td>Draw valid conclusions</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44 students</td>
<td>Reflect</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Examples of Actions resulting from Assessment Results

• Written communications skills
  – FCA Action plan
  – Feedback to/from students
• Other communications skills
• Critical/Creative thinking
  – Revised LO’s; rubrics, identified gaps
• Global/multi-cultural – ongoing
• Teamwork – as part of leadership
Streamlining AoL Processes

- Strive to achieve more with less effort
- Dovetail with normal coursework marking with cross-checks from external assessors
- Assess multiple objectives separately but at same time
- Design assessment for AoL purposes as well as for grading
- Documenting and streamlining processes
Mistakes we made

... and how to avoid them

- Group reports – not appropriate for assessing most LO’s
  - OK to use to assess Teamwork effectiveness
- Rubric not tuned (too many E’s)
  - Try out on pilot, check across markers
- Assessment not suitable for LO – too many U’s
  - Revise assignment so students are able to demonstrate well
- Too many borderline cases
  - Remember it’s not grading!
  - For AoL, we’re really only interested in broad categories
- Forgot to take copies of student work before handing back to students ...
  - Have systems in place to catch it in time!
Achievements so far

• A working system
  – Planning, Collecting data, Learning, Acting
  – continuous improvement cycle

• More clarity via rubrics – flowing through to clearer assessments

• Improving ILO’s

• Growing suite of rubrics: for generic skills as well as major specific attributes
Next Challenges

• Validity of assessment
  – How to improve consistency of assessing and enhance validity: …
  – How to train markers and calibrate external assessors

• Developing and assessing other LO’s
  eg multi-cultural teamwork, ethics, …
Questions and comments

Thank you!

vicky.mabin@vuw.ac.nz
stephen.marshall@vuw.ac.nz

http://www.victoria.ac.nz/fca/teaching/
http://www.victoria.ac.nz/fca/teaching/aolresources.aspx