



COUNCIL

**Minutes of the Council Meeting held on Monday, 24 September 2018
From 12.30 pm to 6.00 pm in the Council Chamber, Level 2, Hunter Building,
Kelburn Campus**

PRESENT: Mr Neil Paviour-Smith (Chancellor)
Professor Grant Guilford (Vice-Chancellor)
Mr John Allen
Ms Robyn Bargh
Ms Traci Houpapa
Associate Professor Kate Hunter
Dr Carwyn Jones
Mr Alan Judge
Ms Isabella Lenihan-Ikin
Ms Alexandria Mark
Dr Farib Sos
Dame Therese Walsh (Pro-Chancellor)
Ms Caroline Ward (Secretary to Council)

APOLOGIES: Nil

IN ATTENDANCE: Dr Lucy Baragwanath, Deputy Vice-Chancellor, Engagement
Ms Annemarie de Castro, Director Human Resources
Ms Katherine Edmond, Associate Director, Communications and Marketing
Ms Janet Fletcher, University Librarian
Dr Meegan Hall, Assistant Vice-Chancellor, Centre for Academic Development
Mr Simon Healy, Director Strategic Projects
Ms Julia Innocente-Jones, Assistant Vice-Chancellor, International
Mr Simon Johnson, General Counsel
Ms Maria Jones, Acting Director, Communications, Marketing and Engagement
Professor Wendy Lerner, Provost
Mr Mark Loveard, Chief Operating Officer
Mr Blair McCrae, Assistant Vice-Chancellor, International Engagement
Mr Les Montgomery, Chief Financial Officer
Mr Phil O'Connell, Director, Safety, Risk & Assurance
Dr Matthew O'Meagher, Principal Advisor, International Reputation
Professor Ian Williamson, Pro Vice-Chancellor and Dean, Victoria Business School
Professor Mike Wilson, Pro Vice-Chancellor and Dean, Science, Engineering,
Architecture & Design

IN ATTENDANCE: over 100 members of the public, sign in register held on the file for this meeting

18.192 WELCOME / APOLOGIES

- Noted:**
- 1 that the Chancellor welcomed everyone to the meeting especially the large turnout of members of the public.
 - 2 that there were no apologies.

18.193

DECLARATIONS AND DISCLOSURES OF INTERESTS

Noted: 1 that there were the following disclosures of interest by members of Council, by way of a general notice under the Education Act 1989 Section 175 and the Local Authorities (Members Interests) Act 1968.

In relation to minute 18.196(2), Vice-Chancellor's report:

- Ms Houpapa declared an interest in her capacity as Chair of the Federation of Maori Authorities.

In relation to minute 18.202, 2019 Domestic Tuition Fees:

- Mr Paviour-Smith, Dame Therese and Mr Allen declared an interest as they expect to have children studying at the university in 2019.
- Ms Lenihan-Ikin declared an interest as she will be a student during 2019.

In relation to minute 18.201, Name simplification

- Professor Guilford declared a conflict due to his public comments in support of the name simplification proposal. Following consideration the Chancellor declared that the Vice-Chancellor would be asked to step away from the Council table for this item, could stay for the discussion and speak to the subject but abstain from the vote.

2 that the Disclosures of Interests Register was available at all times on the Resource Centre of Board books and circulated with material for all Council meetings.

3 that the Chancellor reminded Council members to advise the Secretary to Council of any disclosures between meetings.

18.194

COUNCIL MINUTES, MEETING HELD ON 27 AUGUST 2018

Received: the public Minutes of the meeting of Council held on 27 August 2018.

Noted: that Emeritus Professor Lydia Wevers was also a finalist in the Women of Influence Awards and should be added to minute 18.169.

Resolved: that as amended the Minutes of the meeting of Council held on 27 August 2018 be approved.

Allen/Bargh
Carried
180174

18.195

REPORT FROM THE CHANCELLOR

Received: an oral report from the Chancellor.

Noted: that since the last meeting of Council on 27 August 2018 the Chancellor:

- attended the official launch by the Hon Grant Robertson of the new funding partnership between VicLink and Booster
- attended an event hosted by the Mayor regarding the Wellington City Council's Living Wage announcement
- attended the Auckland Alumni event at which the Great Futures initiative was highlighted.
- met with the Vice-Chancellor
- met with the Secretary to Council

- attended the Finance Committee meeting
- met with Professor Geoff McLay
- attended the pre-event hospitality for the NZSM opera *Eat your Heart Out* opening night
- hosted a Council workshop
- attended Victoria University Press book launch of *Stardust and Substance: The New Zealand General Election of 2017*.

Resolved: that the Chancellor's report be noted.

Sos/Allen
Carried
180175

18.196

REPORT FROM THE VICE-CHANCELLOR

Received: a report from the Vice-Chancellor dated 18 September 2018 (document VUWC 18/127).

Noted:

- 1 that the report was taken as read.
- 2 that the Vice-Chancellor highlighted the following:
 - the launch of the *Manufacturing our Future* series of events as part of the *Stimulating a design-led, high-value manufacturing region* initiative
 - the commencement of the MOOC on New Zealand Landscape as Culture: Maunga (Mountains) delivered by Dr Maria Bargh and Emeritus Professor Lydia Wevers. At last count there were 1,300 enrolments from a worldwide intake
 - the presentation by Professor Rod Downey from the School of Mathematics and Statistics of this year's Gödel Lecture at the annual meeting of the Association of Symbolic Logic in Udine Italy
 - a new five-year innovation partnership between the Faculty of Law and Lexis/Nexis providing law students with technology to support their studies, transition to the workplace, as well as 35 scholarships over five years
 - the launch by the Development Office of the Great Futures programme which aims to more than double the University's philanthropic scholarship funds by 2020
 - commencement of the Te Rōpū Awhina outreach programme Tuhono, designed to inspire Māori and Pasifika students into STEM and STEM-related areas. The programme has been delivered to 1,400 students from Lower Hutt, Tokoroa and Taranaki areas
 - Victoria Business School, in partnership with Te Pūtea Whakatupu Trust and the Federation of Māori Authorities, delivered a five-day programme, Hei Rātā Whakaruruhau, involving 22 emerging Māori leaders between 18-35 years of age aiming to prepare young people for governance jobs within iwi organisations
 - the new partnership between Viclink and NZ financial services company Booster will see Booster invest at least \$10 million in businesses resulting from the University's world-leading research.
- 3 that Dame Therese Walsh highlighted the success of the recent Feminist Engagements in Aotearoa: 125 Years of Suffrage and Beyond Conference led by Associate Professor Kate Hunter and Professor Charlotte Macdonald.

Resolved: that the Vice-Chancellor's report be noted.

Walsh/Mark
Carried
180176

18.197 **REPORTS FROM COMMITTEE CHAIRS**

Received: the Minutes from the following meetings:

- Academic Board report, 21 August 2018
- Finance Committee, 10 September 2018

Noted:

Academic Board

- 1 that the Student Services Transformation programme was aimed at making processes more student-centric, transparent, modern and consistent.
- 2 that proposals under consideration by CUAP were noted including the proposed new Bachelor of Communication degree, a new major: Animation and Visual Effects (Bachelor of Design Innovation and GradDipDI) and an amendment to the foundation courses for Māori students.

Resolved: **that the Minutes be noted.**

Mark/Lenihan-Ikin
Carried
180177

18.198 **FORTHCOMING EVENTS AND NEXT MEETING**

Received: a Council paper from the Secretary to Council dated 18 September 2018 listing Forthcoming Events (document VUWC 18/128).

Noted:

- 1 that the next meeting of Council will take place on Monday, 29 October 2018 starting at 12.30 pm.
- 2 that Council members had been asked to consider the proposed 2019 committee dates tabled at the August meeting and this was work in progress.

Resolved: **that the Council paper on Forthcoming Events and the date and details for the next Council meeting on Monday, 29 October be noted.**

Paviour-Smith/Sos
Carried
180178

18.199 **FINANCIAL REPORT TO 31 AUGUST 2018**

Received: the Financial Report to 31 August 2018 (document VUWC 18/129).

Resolved: **that the Financial Report to 31 August 2018 be noted and approved.**

Mark/Jones
Carried
180179

18.200 **GRADUATES IN ABSENTIA**

Received: the list of degrees, diplomas and certificates granted on 24 September 2018 (document VUWC 18/130).

Resolved:

- 1 that Council grants the degrees, diplomas and certificates in this University on those persons listed in document VUWC 18/130 and that their names be entered on the Roll of Graduates on 24 September 2018.

- 2 that a motion of congratulations to the Graduates in Absentia was recorded.

Lenihan-Ikin/Mark
Carried
180180

18.201

NAME SIMPLIFICATION

Received: a Council Paper from the Vice-Chancellor dated 24 September 2018 on Name Simplification (document VUWC 18/131).

- Noted:**
- 1 that the Council Paper was taken as read.
 - 2 that the Chancellor acknowledged the large turnout of members of the public as well as the significant number of submissions, all of which had been received and read by the Council.
 - 3 that the Vice-Chancellor had earlier declared a conflict (see Minute 18.193(1)). It was agreed that the Vice-Chancellor could stay for the discussion and speak to the subject but not vote. At this point Professor Guilford stepped away from the Council table and joined the senior leadership team.
 - 4 that the Chancellor introduced the paper and highlighted its recommendations in particular recommendation 1 - that the Council recommend to the Minister of Education that the legal name of the University be changed from 'Victoria University of Wellington' to 'University of Wellington'.
 - 5 that the Vice-Chancellor spoke to the report outlining the process up until today and the context for the proposed name change. He stressed the need to differentiate the University in what has become an increasingly disrupted sector, in line with our strategic plan as a world-leading capital city university.
 - 6 that the Vice-Chancellor acknowledged the depth of feeling and affection for the name Victoria however his first duty was to the institution and that he was strongly of the view that the proposed name change was a fundamental step in ensuring the ongoing viability of the university and enabling the university to better achieve its potential.
 - 7 that the proposed name change would help strengthen our international reputation, deepen engagement with our city and flow on to strengthening the student experience.
 - 8 that the Chancellor invited the following speakers to address the meeting. These individuals had all written to the Chancellor in advance requesting the opportunity to address the Council and the Chancellor had agreed to those requests:
 - Professor Geoff McLay, Victoria Law School (against the proposal)
 - Ms Vivian Tan and Mr Han Chng, Law School students (against the proposal)
 - Sir Maarten Wevers, Member of the Victoria Foundation Trust Board (for the proposal)
 - Emeritus Professor Nigel Roberts, Political Science and International Relations programme (for the proposal).
 - 9 that the speaking notes from the speakers are held on the file for the meeting.
 - 10 that each member of the Council spoke. Key themes included the international context in which we must now operate, parameters set by government and associated financial impacts, the increasing competition

and disruption that is occurring across the tertiary sector, confusion over the University's name in the international market, the need to link more closely with the city and leverage off its increasingly strong international reputational, the need to honour tradition, the need to focus on substantive ideas and avoid personal attacks, support for the proposed change to the University's Māori name, concerns around the name change proposal process and the critical need to maintain delivery of a quality experience to our students.

- 11 that nine Council members spoke in support with two members stating that they were opposed.
- 12 that the next step, should the vote support resolution 1, would be to write to the Minister of Education asking that the legal name of the University be changed from Victoria University of Wellington to University of Wellington; and that, subject to the Minister's approval of a change in name to University of Wellington, that the University's Māori name change from Te Whare Wānanga o Te Ūpoko O Te Ika a Māui change to Te Herenga Waka.
- 13 that the Chancellor acknowledged all present for their obvious passion for the University whether for or against the proposed name change. He particularly recognised the diligence of Council members in reading all of the submissions and giving thorough consideration as part of their decision. He especially acknowledged the staff and student members of Council who had been on the receiving end of some unpleasant and unacceptable reaction. He also acknowledged the efforts of staff in handling the submissions and related workload and the efforts of the Vice-Chancellor who had also received personal criticism with regard to his advocacy for the proposed change.
- 14 that the Chancellor stated it was important to look to the future whilst acknowledging our proud history.

Resolved:

- 1 that, under section 162(5) of the Education Act 1989, the Council recommend to the Minister of Education that the legal name of the University be changed from the 'Victoria University of Wellington' to 'University of Wellington'.

Paviour-Smith/Walsh
Carried
180181

Against: Houpapa and Sos
Abstained: Guilford

- 2 that the Chancellor be authorised to make this recommendation on behalf of the Council.

Paviour-Smith/Walsh
Carried
180182

Against: Houpapa and Sos
Abstained: Guilford

- 3 that provided Council's recommendation is approved by the Minister of Education:
- a) the University's Māori name be changed from Te Whare Wānanga o te Ūpoko o te Ika a Māui to Te Herenga Waka, with effect from the effective date of the Gazette notice published by the Minister under section 162(5) of the Education Act 1989;

- b) **the use and heritage of the word 'Victoria' be maintained in a meaningful way by the ongoing use of the word Victoria in the life of the University; and**
- c) **the Vice-Chancellor be authorised to do all things necessary or desirable to implement the change to the University's name.**

Paviour-Smith/Walsh

Carried

180183

Against: Houpapa and Sos

Abstained: Guilford

The meeting adjourned at 3.50 pm

The meeting resumed at 4.10 pm

18.202

DOMESTIC TUITION FEES FOR 2019

Received: a Council paper from the Chief Financial Officer dated 18 September 2018 regarding Domestic Tuition Fees for 2019 (document VUWC 18/132).

Noted:

- 1 that the Council paper was taken as read.
- 2 that the Finance Committee considered the 2019 Domestic Tuition fees paper in detail at its meeting held on Monday, 10 September 2018 and was supportive of all the recommendations.
- 3 that the Vice-Chancellor had hosted a 'Rant with Grant' forum for students to engage in advance of the Council meeting.
- 4 that the following individuals addressed the Council having requested in writing in advance with the Chancellor the opportunity to do so. Full transcripts are attached as appendix 1.
 - Mr Marlon Drake (VUWSA President)
 - Ms Priyanka Roy (Post Graduate student)
 - Ms Ravethi Jeyakumar (International Student)
- 5 that Council members Ms Mark and Ms Lenihan-Ikin spoke to the report.
Ms Houpapa left the meeting at 4.45 pm
- 6 that after many years of lobbying Ms Mark recorded a deep note of appreciation on the appointment of a Rainbow support person.
- 7 that the Chancellor thanked all speakers and acknowledged that students well understand the challenges with fee-setting especially when they have an informed appreciation of the financial realities faced by the university. It was also important to challenge the environment in which universities operate due to government policy and financial restraints. The Chancellor requested management consider how to engage with students more effectively and in a more timely manner next year, taking into account the effectiveness of the process in place for setting the agreed student services levy.

Resolved: **that on the recommendation of the Finance Committee Council approve:**

- 1 **domestic (Government funded) tuition fees for all undergraduate and postgraduate subject areas be increased by 2%.**

Judge/Walsh

Carried 10/1

180184

Against: Lenihan-Ikin

Resolutions 2-6 taken together

- 2 exceptions to the above as set out in Appendix 3, paying particular
attention to the new Doctor of Health, Nursing and Midwifery
qualifications.
- 3 full-fee international tuition fees for new programmes that had not been
included in the Full-Fee 2019 recommendation paper (VUWC18-14,
approved in February 2018)
- 4 the 2019 Student Services Levy be set at \$790 for students studying 25
points or more and \$395 for students studying less than 25 points
- 5 the 2019 Student Assistance Levy be set at \$27.60
- 6 the proposed 2019 Student Fee Statute, with updates as set out in
Appendix 5.

Judge/Allen

Carried unanimously

180185

18.203 RESOLUTION CONCERNING THE EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

Received: a recommendation that certain items be taken with the public excluded
(document VUWC 18/132).

Resolved: that the public be excluded from the meeting for the discussion of items
13-21 for the reasons and duration outlined in the recommendation, with
the exception of such members of the management team as the
Chancellor and the Vice-Chancellor may request to remain for the public
excluded part of the agenda as they have knowledge relevant to particular
issues to be discussed.

Paviour-Smith/Hunter

Carried

180186

Appendix 1

Ravethi Jeyakumar, President of VUWSA International Students' Association (V-ISA)

Kia Ora Members of the University Council, Senior Leadership Team and staff and fellow students,
Thank you for giving us the opportunity to present the international students' perspective on the Fees setting Agenda 2020. My name is Ravethi Jeyakumar and I am speaking on behalf of all international students in my capacity as the President of VUWSA International Students' Association (V-ISA).

As a student representative group with more than 300 members, we have actively ensured that the voice of international students is heard by the university. From our Fair Fees and Equitable Access to Scholarships for International Students campaign two years ago, our submission opposing the disestablishment of the University Hall last year and our stance opposing the name simplification proposal, we have taken into account the views of international students at Vic. While we believe in working with the University to provide the best support for international students, it is difficult to do so when the University does not reciprocate this.

In August 2016, V-ISA carried out extensive consultations with international students on fees hike, the inaccessibility and unavailability of scholarships. We received 100 survey responses from undergraduates, EPP students and postgraduates. We proposed 2 recommendations for the University: to put a cap on fees for international students and to make scholarships available and accessible for all international students.

We agreed with the university that fees has to be increased year by year due to overhead costs, inflation and upgrading. However, we disagree that the **fees hike** for international students has to be much more higher than domestic students. International students do not consume more resources than domestic students for every course they take so there is no basis for such a significant difference when International students are already paying approximately **5 times more** than domestic students and **yet our fees increase 4-5% on average** (in numerical sums) per year.

As mentioned previously by V-ISA's Vice President of Equity, Vaelyn Luo, the fees hike does affect the mental health and wellbeing of international students. From our survey in 2016, international students were not only finding it difficult to cope financially but have to struggle with the psychological stress from the lack of financial support provided as well. An overwhelming 60% say that their parents are willing to compromise on their savings to support them. It would also be interesting to note that a sizeable number of students have taken bank loans from their home.

Not only are international students not able to get a student loan here in New Zealand but they also struggle to gain employment in efforts of being financially independent from their parents as well. In 2016, Over 90% of the students who wanted to gain employment are struggling to find one.

In the event that students do gain employment, there remains a high risk of labour exploitation by employers as well. Based on preliminary findings by the NZ International Students Association's experience survey, it is clear that **66.7% of respondents did not have employment contracts**; education.govt.nz Page 3 of 4 o 17.4% of respondents paid below minimum wage, 21.7% did not know pre-tax payrate; o **59.3% of respondents experienced unjust treatment by employers.**

There are a decent number of students who are working below minimum wage. labour exploitation happened in our very own University accomodations, where students are paid wrongly .

How are international students supposed to perform to the best to their abilities academically while struggling with such mental stress?

The University has stated that the best it can do is to be transparent and help potential students to foresee their expenditure. However, what students know is only the lump-sum fee they have to pay for the first year, not the unfair increment of fees they need to pay year on year. Moreover, not all students can predict their future circumstances. Some students who have approached us revealed that they are on the verge of dropping out because of family tragedies back home or that their bank loans are denied. There are little measures put in place to support them. It is important to consider that international students cannot get a student loan in New Zealand.

The other argument was that higher fees reflect better quality of education. In terms of overall teaching quality, Victoria University is the only New Zealand University that has not seen a rise in its QS World Ranking this year (2016). This may not be the best indicator around but it is the most direct and the most accessible indicator for students. In terms of scholarships, forget about the millions being pumped into this area.

While this has improved to 2 scholarships over the years with the International students can apply for two Victoria International scholarships that reward academic excellence. All students can apply for the NZ\$5,000 and NZ\$10,000 Victoria Tongarewa Scholarship. Students who have studied for at least one full year at a New Zealand secondary school can apply for the NZ\$20,000 Victoria International Excellence Scholarship. There remains intense competition for scholarships with domestic students.

We also want to point out that there is a disproportionate number of scholarships provided to students who are entering their first year in Victoria. There remains the irony is that Victoria recruits a huge portion of international students through "twinning" programmes (degree-partnership with foreign universities); many of whom have already completed their first year of university in their home country. They are not eligible for any scholarships, based on merit or otherwise.

93% of international students have shown strong support for a tuition fee waiver scholarship. They want a percentage cut on their tuition fees based on academic achievements and financial needs. This will be more reflective of the costs international students are paying. Lump-sum awards simply do not account for the increase in costs that international

students have to pay. V-ISA urge the University not to view scholarships as a recruitment tool, but an incentive to motivate students and help them to achieve their fullest potential.

V-ISA would like to emphasize the importance of taking international students' views into account when making decisions that matter to their lives. International students are not merely consumers and university education is not merely a commodity. It is difficult to empathise with the position of every international student, but as long as an effort is made to engage us sincerely, Victoria will definitely be able to raise above the standards. Victoria should set the standards of quality education, not a simply taker of standards.

Priyanka Roy, Co-Vice President of the Postgraduate Students' Association

My name is Priyanka, I am the Co-Vice President of the Postgraduate Students' Association, and I am here today to speak in opposition of another fees increase.

Universities NZ states the following on its website regarding postgraduate education: "New Zealand offers a world-class education. All eight universities are ranked within the top 3% in the world."

This statistic gets a whole new meaning when we add the growing trend of deteriorating student health in NZ. The New Zealand Union of Students' Associations commissioned the "Kei Te Pai Report" in 2017 in which it was revealed that tertiary students were failing to reach their potential because of the mental health crisis.

The "Kei Te Pai Report" states that 56 per cent of tertiary students considered dropping out because of stress, anxiety and depression in the very first year of study. The rising cost of education (i.e. tuition fees) was shown to be contributing to financial stress to a "great extent" in 23.7% of respondents and "somewhat extent" in 30.3% of respondents.

Unsurprisingly, many students are upset at the increase in student fees.

It is easy to see that the postgraduate education is a good source of revenue for the university, but the annual hike affects students—both domestic and international. It almost seems that Victoria University of Wellington functions in a way that calls for maximum fee increase every year, and no matter what the collective student body states, this arbitrary fee structure is not going to change. Also, the student involvement in the fee-setting process appears to be a nominal rather than real engagement.

Last year, the fee went up by 2 percent, student levy by 3.5 percent and student insurance by not so meagre increase of 25 percent! This combined surge leads to financial stress for postgraduate students who have limited resources. Students often set their budgets based on current student fees and are not prepared for rising expenses. They might not qualify for additional student loans. Many scholarships don't increase even when student fees go up. Victoria Doctoral Scholarship was last increased in 2011 (that too by 11 percent!). Thus the students feel trapped in the vicious cycle of financial aid, hardship funds and loans to cover rising costs. No wonder, "depression and anxiety reported by postgraduate students are six times higher than in the general population."

The PGSA receives a lot of queries from students who have been impacted by the increased financial burden. Many postgraduate students are part time, also working, have children, are returning to study – and many of these students that the PGSA deals with are ineligible for access to even student loan funding from the government. This means that fees are a great difficulty for them as it stands, and that any increase will certainly act to further deter potential students already struggling to cope financially. There is less support from the government in terms of funding like student allowances, which adds to their financial stress. Unlike undergrads, postgraduate students do not have access to StudyLink services.

Therefore, balancing studies and work to manage the finances can take its toll. There can be no denial that many students who face undue stress opt out of courses or do not pursue further studies. The university earns a significant proportion of its money in the current funding model from international students – continuing to increase their already astronomical fees is not a sustainable income.

The reasons stated by the university for the increase in student fees—to maintain many existing services and manage operating costs—is comprehensible. But to increase fees to the maximum extent allowed every year is disadvantageous to a lot of students who may want higher education, but without the resources they choose not to.

Deciding to embark on a post graduate journey is an enormous commitment, and it is an important time in a student's life when they want to specialise in a particular area, hone their skills and use them to contribute to society. But making courses so costly, and the early salaries being so derisively low, it can be detrimental to even take up the degree in the first place.

In 2011, an important study published in the journal Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis projected a 0.25 percent decline in college enrolment for every \$100 added to tuition. In a world where specialised degrees are increasingly becoming necessary, higher student fees can limit people's access to good jobs. While fees are necessary in the tertiary education environment we operate in, encouraging stability and avoiding fee increases to the greatest extent possible would provide the greatest benefit to postgraduate students.

In today's competitive world, a degree from a world ranked university like Victoria University is an advantage, and it's an advantage many students like me would like to have. However, as universities keep raising their tuition fees, more postgraduates will find themselves discouraged at the prospect of high debts. The higher cost of knowledge is not without its repercussions on our culture, and now more than ever, the onus is on the universities to ensure that these students have done adequately well to make this investment worthwhile.

Therefore, here representing postgraduate students and the PGSA today, I would like to implore the Council to vote against increasing student fees.